



Initiative « 4 per 1000: Soils for Food Security and Climate »



## 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Consortium

29-30 June 2017

Montpellier

### Opening

The 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Consortium was officially opened, and then chaired, on Thursday 29 June at 9.05am by the Vice-President Mr Stéphane LE FOLL (in the absence of the President Mr Ibrahim MAYAKI). The opening was followed by a welcome word from the President of Agropolis International, Mr Bernard HUBERT.

The **agenda** (cf. document *Consortium 2-0*) was approved.

The minutes of the 1st meeting of the **Consortium** in Marrakech on 17 November 2016 (cf. document *Consortium 2-1*) were also approved.

### Official welcoming of new partners and members of the Initiative since the last Consortium meeting

The list of the new members and partners who have joined the Initiative since the last Consortium meeting (17 November 2016), presented by the Executive Secretary, was approved (cf. document *Consortium 2-2*).

### Presentation of the International Organization that is candidate to host the Executive Secretariat of the Initiative (cf. *Powerpoint presentation*).

Mr Alain VIDAL, Director of Strategic Partnerships of the CGIAR System Organization, confirmed, on behalf of Mr Elwyn GRAINGER-JONES, Executive Director of the CGIAR System Organization, that the CGIAR System Organization, funding member of the 'Initiative 4 per 1000', was a candidate to host the Executive Secretariat. He reminded the audience that many CGIAR Research Programs were engaged in the Initiative « 4 per 1000 ». The Memorandum of Understanding provides for up to 4 people seconded to the Executive Secretariat (ie staff being remunerated by their organization/administration) with an annual operating cost of 20 200 € to the CGIAR system Organization, and up to 2 staff (ie staff employed by the CGIAR System Organization for the Initiative « 4 per 1000 » and paid from the Initiative budget) with an annual operating cost of 23 500 € to the CGIAR System Organization.

The members of the Consortium approved this proposition and thanked the CGIAR System organization.

The MoU was then signed by Mr Stéphane LE FOLL for the Consortium of the Initiative 4 pour 1000 and Mr Elwyn GRAINGER-JONES, represented by Mr Alain VIDAL, for the CGIAR System Organization.

### First results of the survey to partners on the projects and research developed in the environment « 4 per 1000 » in the world and discussions on the next steps

The Vice-president invited Mrs Murielle TROUILLET, Ministry of Agriculture and Food in France, to present the first conclusions from the partners' survey (cf. *PPT presentation*).

258 partners were asked to take part, 58 answered, the answer rate is therefore 25%.

The partners wish in particular to develop their network, enable sharing of knowledge or benefit from it, find funding opportunities and/or partnerships.

The first results show the importance to extend the survey to financial institutions or international organizations or to create a specific survey for them.

Some of the actions initiated as part of the Initiative « 4 per 1000 », directly or by some partners, already meet some of the expectations of members and partners. For example, the collaborative platform, the scientific cooperation projects on CIRCASA and SOCa soils carbon or the CST work on a baseline for standards and project monitoring indicators.

### ***Discussion***

The idea of the survey was well received by the members, and some stressed the need for a follow up to get a higher number of responses. The necessity to include the territorial collectivities in the initiative was pointed out. Some also would like to see research actions and operational projects more linked, namely streamline the types of action.

The representative from the Global Environment Facility (GEF) specified that the GEF, which to date includes 183 member countries, had a specific program on sustainable food systems. He emphasized the fact that the negotiations for GEF's next commitment period (2018/2022) had started and would end in June 2018. Therefore, member countries of GEF and the Initiative « 4 per 1000 » could support FEM specific financing for projects that are part of the Initiative « 4 per 1000 ».

The representative from UNCCD (United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification) also pointed out the opportunity the « Land Degradation Neutrality » LDN fund could represent for the projects of the Initiative « 4 per 1000 ».

To prepare for the Consortium meeting and the Forum of the Initiative « 4 per mille » in Bonn in conjunction with COP 23 in November, and to inform the donors; the Vice President suggested to feedback on the ground experiments and the most significant categories of practices that are related to Initiative.

On the whole, it is necessary to enhance the survey and some improvements were suggested:

- The broadening to participants that are not partners of the Initiative, specifically the farmers to be part of a bottom-up approach
- Adding a question on the involvement of the actors in the field on the conditions of success for the projects
- Adding the following question: 'What are the key success factors?' to highlight the successful projects (success stories) and share them within the members of the Initiative to add value.

A comprehensive review of all actions on soil carbon would be useful, according to some members of the Initiative, to avoid duplication.

**Report from the Global Symposium on Soil Organic Carbon (GSOC17) (Cf. PPT presentation).**

Mr Eduardo MANSUR, Director, Land and Water Division at FAO, presented the GSOC17 that took place at FAO in Rome from 21 to 23 March 2017. He also mentioned possible ways to strengthen international cooperation on carbon sequestration in soils.

The GSOC gathered 488 participants from 111 countries. The recommendations are mainly on capacity building, the establishment of detailed guidelines to map and to carry out efficient monitoring reporting and verification (MRV) but also the assessment of soil organic carbon (SOC) sequestration, to identify the benefits, to prioritize land use depending on the level of organic carbon to protect etc. Thus, it must be implemented by showing the farmers the benefits in the short term. UNCCD COP 13 (Desertification) and UNFCCC COP (Climate) will allow us to pursue this work.

During the Symposium, two working groups were created:

- One to develop the general guidelines for the MRV of the soil organic carbon
- One to develop a technical manual on soil organic carbon management, according to the Voluntary Guidelines for Sustainable Soil Management (VGSSM)

Mr MANSUR ended his report by highlighting the importance of joint action, investment in sustainable management of soils, reinforcement of capacity on soils in particular on soil organic carbon.

FAO hopes the recommendations will provide a source of reflection for the members of the Initiative.

### **Discussions**

The representative from the Global Research Alliance on GHG in Agriculture (GRA) mentioned the next GRA Council taking place in Japan in August and suggested that a working group on developing the general guidelines be created there, FAO seemed to approve.

Some members:

- Reminded the Consortium about the importance of Simplified Cultivation Techniques, that lead to sustainable production systems
- Underlined the lack of information on the level of soil erosion, and it needs to be taken into account in the notion of degraded soils
- Highlighted the issue of criterion when dealing with soil carbon stock
- Outlined that the issue of return on investment is also the issue of financial security linked to the questions of soil organic carbon

The Vice-President concluded that there is a considerable heterogeneity amongst soils, which makes the work on indicators difficult, and the work on mapping from FAO crucial (despite cautious optimism from some on the possibility of having, by the end of 2017, a completed global map of the levels of soil organic carbon, when others like Germany can confirm their contribution will be ready on time). It is important to define the existing stocks of soil organic carbon, the potential for growth and the storage dynamics. The CST has a role to play, by providing necessary keys to support the policies. He expressed the wish to see the activities of

the Initiative « 4 per 1000 » associated to the FAO work on the organization of the next GSOC Symposium.

Mr MANSUR indicated that the symposium in 2018 will address the issue of soil contamination.

### **Proposals of the Scientific and Technical Committee**

#### **➤ Orientations of the International Programme for Research and Scientific Cooperation**

STC Vice-Chair Claire Chenu presented the proposed outline of by the STC on the International Research and Scientific Cooperation Programme of the "4 for 1000" Initiative to the Consortium (see ppt presentation).

After the presentation of the governance of the scientific component of the "4 per 1000" initiative, the objectives of an international research and scientific cooperation programme for the "4 per 1000" initiative were explained as:

- provide clear direction to the contributors to allow support for the initiative;
- help to address high-level policy issues to inform national policy or practice or implementation of policy.

The research programme will be comprise four pillars, each with a set of research activities:

- Pillar 1: Estimation of the potential for sequestration of soil organic carbon and its associated benefits;
- Pillar 2: Development of practices adapted to specific soil and climate conditions;
- Pillar 3: Definition and strengthening of the enabling environment;
- Pillar 4: Monitoring, Communication and Verification (MRV).

The STC encourages synergies between new research activities and existing activities and these were indicated in relation to the four pillars as presented in a diagram during the meeting. The CIRCASA, SOCa projects and the GRA "Flagship" project on carbon sequestration in soils of, which cover all or part of the four pillars, were included.

### ***Discussion***

The representative of GRET stressed the importance of recognising the contribution of other non-CO<sub>2</sub> greenhouse gases and issues of their global nature. In line with the Danish Ministry of Agriculture that has requested an inventory of research activities aligned with the framework of the "4 for 1000" initiative (in order to answer the question: who does what?), the added value of the scientific programme of the Initiative was questioned.

The GRA, through its representative, insisted that maintaining an organic carbon content in soils over time requires the development of integrated analysis and consideration of both ecological and socio-economic aspects. Another stakeholder reflected the necessary decoupling between an increase in food production and an increase in environmental degradation, as there may also be co-benefits for ecosystems.

The representative of Wageningen UR and those of several NGOs including AVSF pointed out that it is not only a question of measuring the performance, but also the value of the practices and their development. It is not simply a question of promoting and developing good practices, but above all, of fostering the sustainable transition towards these good practices. In short, to develop long-term trajectories. To achieve this, a comparison between production

systems could help. In addition to this approach, the CASA network representative from Madagascar emphasized the importance of partnership with agriculture to co-define agricultural practices, while taking into account the differences between practices in the northern and southern hemispheres.

Representatives from the Spanish Ministry of Agriculture and Senegal asked how the objectives of the 4 per 1000 Initiative will be integrated into public policies or projects to mitigate climate change. They pointed out that access to funding linked to carbon credits would certainly make it possible to subsidize such actions sustainably.

Summarizing the points made by other participants, the Vice-President stressed that, with respect to Europe, a reform of the Common Agricultural Policy should be promoted to increase the uptake of practices based on three criteria (soil organic matter, biodiversity above- and below-ground components and soil cover). This could be achieved by aligning the work of aid systems to improving the 3 criteria and monitor progress. In addition, renewal of multilateral negotiations at the WTO (green box) would provide opportunities to discuss the use of carbon credits to finance such public policies.

In this context, the President of ITPS stated that the Presidency of the European Union in the second half of 2017 wanted to highlight the importance of soils by convening a high-level conference on 5 October 2017 entitled "Soils for sustainable food production and ecosystem services "

➤ **Draft set of criteria and indicators for the evaluation of projects**

Mrs. Magali Garcia Cardenas, Chair of the STC, presented the Committee's work to develop criteria and indicators for the evaluation of projects (see ppt presentation).

The indicators identified are based on the Sustainable Development Objectives (SDGs) with SDGs 2, 13 and 15 as direct targets and SDGs 6 and 12 as associated targets for the "4 per 1000" Initiative.

The STC definition for a project is:

"a project must refer to a specific action for well-defined ecosystems at specified spatial and temporal scales (crops, grasslands, forests, etc.) that will lead to a targeted change in soil carbon stock. The outcome should be linked to land management and/or land use practices and include expected benefits and potential trade-offs for communities."

The STC proposed to evaluate the projects according to five criteria:

- (i) soil organic carbon (SOC) and soil conservation or restoration;
- (ii) food security;
- (iii) mitigation;
- (iv) adaptation
- (v) certain aspects of safeguards (protection and enhancement of property rights, protection of human rights, of well-being, of the environment and of capacity-building).

For each criterion, a set of indicators, methodologies and assessment measures were identified.

The STC has also proposed its role in using these criteria to evaluate projects. At the request of the Consortium, the STC will provide evaluations of projects to inform the project leader

that will include suggestions and provide advice for improvement. This will not be a validation process. There will also be a process of self-assessment with the intention that the findings will be published on the Initiative's website.

Each assessment will be undertaken using a "code of conduct" consistent with the STC Terms of Reference. This will clarify the respective responsibilities of the Executive Secretariat and the STC and will prevent conflicts of interest.

### ***Discussion***

Consortium members congratulated the STC for its achievements and encouraged the Committee to continue with its work, taking into account the comments made. The flexibility of the process and its non-punitive approach were welcomed because these will encourage the facilitation, development and implementation of many well-defined projects. To this aim, it was proposed that the "4 per 1000" Initiative should highlight the positive effects of practices that contribute to soil carbon storage rather than practices that do not.

Participants appreciated the introduction of safeguard. Some, however, stressed that greater inclusion of socio-economic criteria would be desirable (employment, increase in income of producers, impact on poverty, measurement of social benefits, etc.). Others warned against the risk of giving the impression that the Initiative could be used to offset other greenhouse gas emissions, and that the balance sheet should be considered in a holistic manner. The STC clarified the issue of environmental contamination which is already considered in its proposals.

The importance of methods of monitoring soil carbon stocks (what depths: 20 or 30 cm?) and their development over time was emphasized, as was the ease of the implementation of these methods (e.g., stock assessment by remote-sensing). In this regard, an exchange with the STAP (Scientific and Technical Advisory Panel of the GEF) which has been working on comparing different soil carbon assessment methodologies has been suggested.

The issue of ranking projects was raised by NGOs. The STC reiterated that this was not part of its mandate to rank projects and it did not have the authority or the resources to do this.

The Vice-Chair suggested investigating how donors could use the advice and recommendations from the STC. This resulted in the decision to organize a multi-stakeholder working group (including farmers, donors and NGOs) that will make it possible to test and improve the assessment framework using pool of projects to be set up. The intention is to adopt working groups at the next meeting in November.

It is envisaged that the Consortium will be able to decide in November on its adoption of the framework for project assessment (which should be specified if it is composed of ex-post or ex-ante indicators) and the associated role of the STC.

### **Introduction of the "CIRCASA" project by Mr Jean-François SOUSSANA (INRA) and the « SOCa » project by Mr Jean-Luc CHOTTE (IRD), for the scientific cooperation of the Initiative**

Mr Jean-François SOUSSANA, Vice-President of INRA and Vice-President of the CST, presented the CIRCASA (coordination of international research cooperation on soil carbon sequestration in agriculture) project. More and more researchers work on this issue and there are different organizations that work on the link between climate change and agriculture, in particular as part of GACSA (Global Alliance for Climate-Smart Agriculture) or CCAFS (CGIAR Research Program on Climate Change, Agriculture and Food Security), and the

European Joint Programming Initiative on Agriculture, Food Security and Climate Change (FACCE-JPI). CIRCASA is planned to last 3 years and is based on a partnership between 24 research institutions. It has 3 objectives (see PPT presentation). It will contribute to the 4 pillars of the research program and will be resourced by 2.5M€ from the European Commission through Horizon 2020.

Mr Jean-Luc Chotte, IRD, presented the SOCa project (beyond climate soil carbon sequestration for sustain tropical family farming). This project involves the family farming systems in West Africa. It relies on the CASA network, other African countries (Benin, Cameroun, Ivory Coast and Madagascar), as well as some CGIAR centers (the World Agroforestry Center (ICRAF) and the International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA)). The project is funded by BNP Paribas and contributes to pillars 1, 2 and 3 of the research program of the Initiative « 4 per 1000 ».

**Presentation of the progress on the new internet site of the Initiative, including the collaborative platform and the digital ressources center (cf PPT presentation)**

Mr Philippe CORNUEJOLS, Initiative consultant, presented the first visuals and functionalities of the site. It comprises of a public space with welcome pages (personalized by type of organization wishing to join the Initiative – country, district or International Organizations, public or private funding agencies, civil society or NGO, producers associations, for-profit companies, research and higher education institutions) and a dedicated collaborative platform for members of the forum, but that can be opened to interested individuals, like small farmers.

It will be possible to create sub-groups to work on specific projects in the collaborative platform.

A call for volunteers to coordinate, proofread, test, translate this evolving site and feedback as a user, as well as to form a test group of the collaborative platform, was issued.

**Informations on the Executive Secretariat (SE) and its composition (cf. Document Consortium 2-6 and PPT presentation)**

In an ideal world, the Executive Secretariat should consist of 3 people besides the Executive Secretary and their Assistant

- one person for scientific aspects,
- one for the aspects « field projects »,
- one communications and web officer

The fact that the Executive Secretariat only comprises of the Executive Secretary at the moment means that it was not possible to start a communications campaign – that should be done for Bonn.

The Spanish delegation announced a secondment for the scientific part. The members of the Consortium thanked Spain for this important contribution.

**Status of the Initiative in terms of financial and human resources (cf. Document Consortium 2-7 and PPT presentation)**

The forecast annual budget for 2018 is 650 000 € and was presented (for information) before it is presented to the Consortium in Bonn for review and acceptance. An appeal to members for contributions was done to get closer to the 835 k€ 2017 budget as approved in Marrakech in November 2016.

Contributions in kind from the CGIAR System Organization (the hosting, free of charge, of the Executive Secretary from 1<sup>st</sup> September 2016 to 31<sup>st</sup> May 2017 and the hosting of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the CST), from Cirad (support for the organization of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the CST and the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Consortium in Montpellier), from Agreenium (organization of the Poster session during the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Consortium) and Agropolis International (partial payment of the rent for the room for the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Consortium) were mentioned by the Executive Secretary and appreciated by the Consortium members.

The German delegation announced support of the costs linked to the organization of the meeting of the Forum and the Consortium in Bonn in conjunction with COP23, on 16 November, “the ‘4 per 1000’ Initiative Day”, that should be opened by a Ministerial High-Level Segment. The members of the Consortium thanked Germany for this important contribution.

**Exchange of ideas on the next meetings for the Initiative in 2017** (cf. *Document Consortium 2-8 and PPT presentation*)

A comprehensive calendar of the statutory meetings (Forum, Consortium and CST) of the ‘4 per 1000’ Initiative as well as the possible participation through side events or interventions from the President or the Vice-President was presented to the members of the Consortium. The next statutory meetings will take place during COP23 in Bonn, on 14 and 15 November 2017 for the CST and on 16 November for the Forum and the Consortium.

The conference on soils organized by Estonia (holding the current Presidency of the Council of the European Union) from 4 to 6 October in Tallinn was added to the calendar.

Moreover, during the discussion, the question of sponsorship of events by the Initiative ‘4per1000’ was raised. Some members called for vigilance on this: such a decision needs to be taken following priorities and criteria for the selection of events to sponsor.

The Vice-President added that in the development phase of the Initiative it was possible to be opened but that in the longer term some rules would need to be set.

**Report on the Conference “Sequestering carbon in soils: tackling the threat of climate change”** (Cf. *PPT presentation*)

Mrs Suzanne Lutfalla, scientific secretary of the Initiative, presented this conference that was organized in Paris from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 5<sup>th</sup> May 2017 with 2016 participants from 34 countries.

The objective was to create an informal network made up of scientists, farmers, NGOs, investors, philanthropists, government representatives, and companies, to develop carbon sequestration in soils through agriculture.

Amongst the conclusions of this conference, it was mentioned that a collaborative platform (on a large scale) to help bring all the stakeholders together is much needed. The Initiative « 4 per 1000 » made the point that their own collaborative platform could help meet that need.

**Report on “Desertif’ Actions 2017” organized in Strasbourg on 27 and 28 juin 2017** (Cf. *PPT presentation*)

Mr Chotte (IRD) reported on this international summit organized by CARI (NGO), Climate Chance and the city of Strasbourg, in collaboration with UNCCD, that gathered non-state actors in the context of the fight against desertification and land degradation. The Initiative « 4 per 1000 » was mentioned in the closing statement in Strasbourg.

**Introduction to the multi-stakeholders' events organized in Montreal (Canada) in October 2017 and in Latin America in 2018 (cf PPT presentation)**

Mrs Ercilia SAHORES and Mr Ron CUNNING presented Regeneration International (NGO). It brings together civil society actors including scientists, farmers and consumers, and is actively involved in the Initiative « 4 per 1000 ». The next events are planned in October 2017 in Montreal and in 2018 in Latin America.

Mr André LEU from IFOAM (active member of Regeneration International) said a few words on how important it is to promote more sustainable practices in enhancing carbon stocks in soils.

The Vice-President insisted, to conclude this point, on the necessity to give back to Africa the ability/capacity to feed itself by producing and transforming its own productions – the Initiative « 4 per 1000 » can help reach this objective.

**Reflection on the role of teaching and training in the Initiative (Cf. PPT presentation)**

Mr Claude BERNHARD, Agreenium director, presented the benefits of training and teaching as a critical issue for all stakeholders of the Initiative. Digital teaching tools like Massive Open Online Courses (MOOC) allow for a lot of possibilities, like the MOOC ‘agroecology’.

A project of MOOC « 4 per 1000: soils for food security and climate » could be launched with the involvement of Agreenium, suggesting 2 to 3 hours of study per week for 5 weeks and geared towards a wide audience. It seems crucial for the Initiative to succeed to spread good practices and train those who will be the actors in the world of tomorrow.

**Closure of the Consortium meeting**

At 1.15pm, no other business being raised, the Vice-President closed the meeting after thanking the participants, the interpreters and all the contributors to the organization of the meeting. He invited the members of the Consortium to meet again in Bonn on 16 November.